

EXHIBIT 5

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: General Counsel how do we help each other know where to begin in this compliance area so we get a list or something some way to work methodically through the process of compliance.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Relative if we are looking at partisan fairness because the map that was run by Dr. Handley and Mr. Morgan through the software last week identified that there could be adjustments made regarding partisan fairness.

And the lopsided margins will identify the districts in which we can -- the Commission can look at and focus in on and decide if there need to be adjustments made.

Mr. Adelson will be here just after the lunch recess at 1:00 or 1:30 so he will be able to have the benefit of his expertise at that time.

But the comments were directed towards partisan fairness not Voting Rights Act.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: So that's where we need to start.

So we need to start by looking at VRA compliance even though Dr. Adelson is not here we know what we are looking for and before looking at communities of interest or beyond the VRA we need to make sure we are in compliance with the V RA or it will be an endless circle we are in.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay let's start where Dustin said.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Would you like some help?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I would like a lot of help.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Are there Commissioners here who understand where the adjustments to the VRA to get us towards VRA compliance are there Commissioners here who have suggestions or can help Commissioner Vallette?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I would start with Metro Detroit because that is where we know we will have an issue.

So those districts that are in Metro Detroit 17, 19, 13, 8, 6, 7, 9, maybe 10 and 12 as well.

Hold on.

And I would look at what their voting population is.

Because the range we were suggested by in this area by Dr. Handley and Mr. Adelson was between 35% and 40% voting age population African/American.

So I would look where we don't have that and those are areas where we would need to make adjustments.

Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I thought last time we worked on this when we because this was the first one we completed I thought that Mr. Adelson said that it was VRA compliant for the Metro Detroit area.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I'm seeing some nodding heads.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Last week we gave us slightly modified directions and remember he said if you can give the African/American population the ability to elect

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

with 35% why would you go with 50, why would you go with 60 so that was why the House District was redrawn was based on that guidance that he had given.

Because Dr. Handley's report says that the ability to elect in the Metro Detroit area because there is so much cross over voting 35 to 40% is really the threshold where you have a voting rights compliant District because the people in that area can vote to elect and have a candidate of choice with only 35% because there is so much cross over voting.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay so then in order to understand that so if we sort of scroll through and look at the racial demographics as percentage of voting population and non-Hispanic Black column and walk down that column it's District 6 it looks like is the first District that is 47 that maybe that we might that you may want to work on Janice, District 6 and then yeah, the other ones that were.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: 6.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: 8 and 9.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: 8 and 9 although 8 is pretty close but may adjust between are 8 and 9 bordering? No, they are not.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: 6 and 8 are bordering.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: 6 and 8 are bordering.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Nine and 13 are the highest it looks like.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah so, I mean but you could also look at 7 and move some of 6 into 7 that would reduce your 6.

And then just a little shifting operation, right? You're shifting maybe.

So 9 is 50%.

6 is 47%.

8 is 43.25%.

And then we have 13, which is 57.3.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay well let's start with six.

And then John I want to look north of six to see if we can take some from there.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Maybe the theme for voting age Black population would help.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: The dots, yes.

>> MR. MORGAN: Is that what you like?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, this is the theme on the voting precincts.

One moment.

Okay.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Can you turn your mic on.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I wanted to take from the corner there on Sterling Heights.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. MORGAN: This into District 6?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: North.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: In District 5 you would take.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, can I just take the corner and not the one that has a dot in it?

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah, certainly.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay.

>> MR. MORGAN: Let me undo that.

I'm not sure it actually took.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay.

>> MR. MORGAN: I'm going to Zoom in so we can see the population for that.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, could you review what metrics we are trying to get towards? You indicated that Bruce gave us some different direction. I agreed with what Anthony said that I thought he felt that this map was okay, so what is our target.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Do you remember Dr. Handley's report where she broke down for Wayne County for the racial polarized voting and gave a chart with percentages that is what Bruce was mentioning last week and that's what I'm referring to.

The very last Page where she listed the percentage of voters in that particular demographic that you needed in order for it to be an opportunity to elect District.

And for Metro Detroit region it was 35%.

So that is what Bruce was saying to us last week and said it repeatedly we should aim between 35-40% African/American because those numbers it is VRA compliant, they can elect their candidate of choice and his point that he mentioned was why would you put 50 or 60% African/American in a population if you can achieve compliance with 35 so that was kind of his point.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: You are trying to reduce the African/American population.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: To 35-40 for VRA purposes per the direction of Bruce Adelson.

>> MR. MORGAN: I'm going to just back up one here.

It looks like the program is not actually assigning the population.

So I'm going to rebuild that plan.

It will just take a moment.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Is it locked by any chance or just being.

>> MR. MORGAN: That is a possibility I'll look at that too.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So I guess we can't get clarification from Mr. Adelson until 1:00.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But I remember also that he was happy with this.

And I do remember that he said you could work on it more and get it better but I feel like there is no end.

We could always work on it and get it more.

So I don't know how.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: General Counsel can you weigh in here?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA:

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: You're muted General Counsel.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: You're on mute.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: I most certainly am I apologize.

That through the Chair to Commission Orton and yes that's correct.

Mr. Adelson is in transit right now so he is not available unfortunately.

That and you are also correct that the adjustments can be made again as often as the Commission wanted.

This was the map that Mr. Adelson indicated was compliant.

And of course further adjustments can always be made at the Commission's discretion.

But your recollection is accurate.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: So then just leave it if you want to.

Commissioner Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Well if this map is compliant with the V RA let's move on to another map that's not compliant with the V RA.

Before you even start tinkering for other reasons in the Senate map.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: I apologize for the interruption Madam Chair.

Again the District that you are focusing on in the Detroit area I believe Commissioner Curry had got the District down almost 16% when she was working on the map.

So I believe Mr. Adelson did say if the effort was to be made to get those Metro Detroit districts closer to the 30 to 40% range that would be an excellent use of time.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, Juanita did you work on the Senate map last week or was it a house map? I thought you were working on a house map.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Madam Chair I'm not really sure.

Which one it was.

I can't remember.

But I know I did work on a couple of them.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yep, all right, and then to Commissioner Witjes' point we do have other I mean even if we say we're not going to change VRA we still have partisan fairness we can look at for this map as well.

So before we move on maybe we want to do that too.

Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I would agree with maybe looking at other areas for now maybe until Bruce gets here to try to achieve partisan fairness.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

We are going to keep hitting this issue of what we as a Commission are going to call VRA compliant based on the advice of our attorneys.

We need to make a decision here on what is VRA compliance.

This is a question I asked last week.

I asked what is the highest number we can have that can still be defended in Court.

Because I don't think any of us want to be breaking up these communities as much as we are.

But we might have to because of VRA, right? The question is how much.

And I think we as a Commission might just need to make that decision.

Is that number 40%.

Is that number 45%.

Is that number 30%.

I don't know but we have to come up with a decision on what it's going to be otherwise we will just keep hitting this arbitrary number this looks good but can always get better until we you know decide like what is VRA compliance to us.

Again us as Commissioners here drawing the maps.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I agree with what Dustin said.

If Bruce has already said we are compliant we should probably keep it that way.

What we're going to do here if we want to make it noncompliant go further north further north until we get it down to 40 percentage or further west.

And it's the geography that puts us in a bind in doing that.

So I would recommend we stay under Bruce's original recommendations that this is compliant and keep it that way.

The Detroit area at this point.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Witjes I'm sorry then Commissioner Curry.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: And to your point that there is other things we can look at for compliance, keep in mind ranked or so let's make sure we get the first two things done and compliant before we move on to other things.

I mean we are just going to get drown in one map and get further into a bind later on this week.

So Commissioner Curry then General Counsel.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, I'm agreeing with what Dustin Commissioner Dustin and Douglas, Doug said.

And I think we ought to wait until Bruce comes and go to something else and work on it and make it compliance, get it to comply with what we need to be doing.

This one is pretty much in order.

Let's just go somewhere else and work on something else and stop this wasting a lot of time just talking, talking, talking.

And we have to talk.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

And I know that.

But we can move on to another one until Bruce comes in.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: That's a great idea Commissioner Curry.

General Counsel?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Extent idea for the Senate map in particular again I think those districts that were up around and over 50% Mr. Adelson's direction was to try to get those lower, to make the effort to get those lower.

Particularly in the Metro Detroit area.

And I again cannot speak for him but I remember that day we were doing the Senate maps and the Congressional maps.

And I believe the Senate maps was the one where he indicated the districts were still packed at the percentage, they are in that they are currently in and that the effort should be made to make those percentages lower.

Because again based only the racial bloc voting analysis, those the percentages of minority voters does not need to be that high in those areas.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Okay, so it sounds like we do still have some VRA work to do with this map specifically districts 13, which is that 57%, 9 which is at 50 and 6 which is at 47.

I certainly I feel like 8 is at 43%.

And I think that's pretty good but we can certainly work on that a little bit but I don't see that as being high priority.

So 13, 9 and 6 are the ones we need to work on to try to bring down those percentages a bit.

Commissioner Rothhorn?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: It might help Commissioners if you are looking at Lisa Handley's presentation Page 20 the map that shows the State House districts and the State Senate districts for the 2010 maps what she shows on that Page 20 is the areas that are packed and what she describes as the most packed is 50% to 70% meaning if we are in 50%, we are not unpacked it if we are 40%, we have not unpacked it.

The map shows where we should target.

All those districts 6, 8, 9 and 13 are all in the area if we are 50% range it's just as packed as it was in 2010.

That's kind of the map that I'm reading here.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: John, can you show the population in District 16 in that square.

>> MR. MORGAN: Sorry we were looking here at District 6 and District 5.

And this was the area you were talking about.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Well, just show me the population of one of those.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. MORGAN: Sure so District 5 which is adjacent is currently 6600 under, so the population is 258542 the District 16 is under by 2900.

It's 262228.

And just to clarify I was having trouble with the spreadsheet updating and now that's been resolved.

So we should be able to click anywhere you want now.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay so this is current right now.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah, this is current, I took it back to the original state, the border between 5 and 6 is the same.

And then you were talking about taking this one precinct in and I did that and it did update.

So would you like me to do that or do something else?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: So can you take, continue up, yes.

>> MR. MORGAN: So this is 2714, I'll just point the attention here to District 6 is 3100 under.

So if we take the 2700 it should be about 400 under so let's see that.

It's 485 under so the software is updating properly.

Then it also changed the demographics slightly.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Not very much.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Rothhorn?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I'll offer one of the strategies that Mr. Adelson said is legitimate to under populate.

To keep that percentage of voting rights down so as you're shifting remember that you don't have to get that exact population if it serves you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: As I look at the numbers in the active matrix, I'm looking at the percent of voting population.

And on District 6 we are 47%.

Which is below that 50 margin, 50% margin.

Now know they want it lower but sometimes you just can't do that because of the distribution of the people.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think what the challenge is that we have to interpret our legal counsel's they are not precise because we are the ones that have to do it.

But I think what we can interpret from their advice is if we don't try to get to 35%, we have not done our due diligence and therefore we may be exposing ourselves to a legal risk we might be able to defend ourselves against but can't guaranty that.

I don't think they are suggesting it's a legal risk.

There is so many unknowns and I think that is why we are trying.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: So Richard did you have a comment? Okay, Mr. Morgan.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yes, if I may address MC's point about under population, just from the theoretical point of view if you had under populated an area with a certain percentage of minority and let's say hypothetically it's right on the money and if you under populated it then the minority percentage might go up a little bit in the sense that it favors the minority community because you have the same amount of minority population but a lower population threshold therefore that same number of people is slightly more effective.

And I think that's what Bruce Adelson was talking about.

So in this circumstance if you under populate it a District, you actually may be not decreasing the minority percentage which is what you seem to be warning to do. So you want to be -- does that make sense? I'm hypothetically explaining that.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: As Janice adds population and potentially in with African/American districts unless they are not African/American districts, if she is adding African/American population she is decreasing, no I got it wrong.

>> MR. MORGAN: If you add nonminority population then you are decreasing the relative percentage of the Black or minority population.

So if you add a nonminority precinct of say 2000 people, then 3,000 whatever it is it's going to lower the minority percentage a little bit which is I think what you're trying to do. But the opposite is if you were to leave it under populated then it sort of it increases the effective percentage of the minority community.

I think that's what Mr. Adelson was alluding to

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Janice, I hope you got that.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: So I want to continue to add the southern part, you know, in Sterling Heights.

So can you add that one, that, yes.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: General Counsel did you have a comment too?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Yes, thank you Madam Chair.

So Mr. Adelson has confirmed that he didn't sign off on either the Senate or the Congressional plan.

And I wanted to also address again the narrative that 50% minority is the -- that is not the courts have not supported that wholesale adoption of 50% or 51%.

What Dr. Handley's racial bloc voting analysis has given the Commission is the benchmarks and the guide rails for each of the Counties that need to be adjusted.

It's Wayne County is 35-40%.

Genesee is 35-40.

Saginaw is 40-45%.

And Oakland County is 42, 43%.

Again that would provide the opportunity to elect.

So you don't need districts with 60% minority voting age population in any of those four Counties to achieve compliance.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Hopefully that clarifies it.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: General Counsel I need those numbers one more time please because I think yeah, I just assumed 35% was for each one but there is a different threshold for each County is what I'm hearing you say so I'm going to write those down.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Correct and those are supported by the charts in Dr. Handley's presentation for each of the Counties, Wayne and Genesee County the recommendation is 35-40%.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Wayne and Genesee.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Uh-huh.
35 to 40 got it.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Saginaw County Mr. Vice Chair is 35-45% and Oakland County is 42-43 and I wrote ish which is a legal term.
So the range is not 40 was too low and 45 Mr. Adelson expressed which too high or could be too high.

So those were the goals identified again by your racial bloc voting analysis.
And the interpretation by your Voting Rights Act counsel.

>> KIM BRACE: The reason why the numbers change with each County is because the voting patterns change within the County.
If you remember my earlier discussion early on was the fact those steppingstones will change with geography, will change with time, all of those factors come into play.
And that's why Lisa always looks at the local patterns that you see and you can tell that by the different Counties.
And that's why she calculated those as separate.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: John I'm trying to take some of the area from north and hopefully try to get some removed from either south or west.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay so at this point you're in Oakland County and Sterling Heights with this District 6 so it's Warren, Sterling Heights.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Right I still want to go back up north.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I want to add some more of that.
See that the giggly line is that the river? So south of that.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay so this one that says 3866.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Just pay attention what you're doing to the total population in District 5 as you're taking from it.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I am, I'm going to try and remove some of the population south or east.
So do is that 3472?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yeah, you are on the right track.
Just take those two right there and see what it does.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Then could are keeping Sterling heights in two districts instead of three.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: 1834 and 4540.
And can I go south?

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah, that is now District five is under populated by 15,000.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: And go west.
And go south between 5 and 6 south.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I'm thinking maybe the theme dots would help again because you're trying to find African/American population to move into -- move out of 6 I believe to balance the numbers.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay can you put those up, John?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioners from Detroit area what do you think of adding Harper Woods? There was something about District 7 the way it's drawn and Harper Woods doesn't really belong there.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Harper Woods can go there.
It's not going to hurt it.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay, I guess what I'm also asking Commissioner Curry I know there are it is an African/American population there and it's -- does it fit better with the District? I know we are looking at Voting Rights Act primarily and holding a lot of complexity but I think if you see that District Warren, Sterling Heights, does Harper and the northeast side of Detroit, does Harper Woods fit in better also there?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yeah, because Harper Woods is on the west side of Woodward so it would fit.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I see is Harper Woods I may have said the wrong one. Harper Woods is on the east side of Woodward and just west of the Grosse Pointes. That is the Harper Woods I meant to say.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay, well.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Can I see south just a little.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Witjes did you have a comment?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Don't worry if Harper Woods wants to be there or community of interest where Harper Woods should be.

That should be not something we're looking at.

We should be going into looking at just complying with the Voting Rights Act.

And if we have to go in there don't let that be a reason as to why because you're thinking about public comment, go straight off the numbers to get where we need to be on with VAR stuff.

And then go look at communities of interest.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I hear that Commissioner Witjes.

I really did think because she was heading south and thought maybe that would work but wasn't sure if there was another reason to maybe go there because it's in 7 and may be balancing 7 out.

I appreciate that very much.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Mr. Morgan?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, so at this point I would just say if you like how District 6 is configured then at this point you're only looking at adjusting District 5's population. So perhaps you could look at adjacent District to 5 to take population.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, I think you accomplished VRA with 6.

You are just a hair over 40% and we are supposed to be between 35-40 so you are good there.

And honestly the population is within deviation so I would just focus on trying to fix 5 at this point.

Or you could move over to 8 and start working on 8 too but whichever you prefer, Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So we are within deviation on 6.

But it is still almost 7,000 high.

So if you took some a little more of the higher Black population in 6 and put it in 5 that's going to decrease the population over all and it will make it under 40% probably.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I agree that is smart thinking but where are you going to pull it from? I mean you could pull a little bit into Detroit.

I mean take 5 into Detroit.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Down, right there.

Right where you have your cursor.

>> MR. MORGAN: You could take a portion of Oakland County precincts into District 5 here, okay.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Or just south of there, that is the Detroit border 2001, 2279, 1690 like that is all Detroit that you could pull up.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay, the 2001.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay let's do that one.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: It's the very upper it's at 8 mile basically just south of 8 mile in Detroit.

Just west of Harper Woods.

Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: But that works too.

But that doesn't help District 6.

If we take that one that's just over the County line 5049 if we put that in 5 maybe that would help the number 6.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Doesn't 6 go into Detroit? Yeah, that is 6, that is 6 too, 6 goes down into Detroit.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I thought it was a different color.

>> MR. MORGAN: Did you want me to revert the 2001 and look at these to up here?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: No, take the 2279.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

Now both districts are within plus or minus 5%.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I think I'm good.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes, you are.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: And you helped make us good.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Brought your African/American below 40%.

So now you are perfectly in the sweet spot of 35-40.

All right.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Vallette, so what we did is we have District 6 completed.

Did you also help us with 8? Okay so we still have 8 to go.

So we moved from 6 we moved from 47.8% voting age non-Hispanic Black voting age population to 39.8.

So a good 10%.

Well almost.

And I guess 8%.

So we are moving now to District 8 or 9 or 13? I'll turn it back over to you Chair Szetela.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: So at this point we will move on to Richard Weiss for your turn.

Department of State staff did you have any questions for Commissioner Vallette?

Thank you very much.

So Commissioner Weiss it's your turn.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: I believe you skipped over Erin.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: She has requested not to have a turn today.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: All right, I guess I'm looking here and are we going to try to do something with District 8? If possible.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes.

We are currently at 43.25 so you want to try to get it to 35-40.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes, I don't think my eraser is big enough.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Do you want me to leave this here for you?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yeah.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Just for the public listening MC Rothhorn was discussing with Commissioner Weiss the populations we are looking at, which is District 8, 43.25 and District 9 which has 50% and 13 which has 57.3. And just directing him those are the districts we are attempting to remedy and bring into compliance.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: All right my suggestions from anybody? I guess I need some help on this one.

Looking at District 17.

You could take a little out of there.

But I don't know if that would help.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I would say 17 will probably not help.

Because I mean you might all the way down near core City which you know where everything meets all the spokes meet.

There are some more white populations along there so you could Zoom in there and look and see if you can pick up there because you are pretty close.

I think your best bet is going to look up along the border into Oakland County.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Since you are a little more familiar with the area would you help out with that?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I can help too.

One of the things that might help is I believe that District 8 is where again we are not focusing on COI so I want to offer this as a way to increase non-Hispanic excuse me decrease the non-Hispanic Black but the Asian American dots District 8 and if we move into Troy 16, I think we also have an Asian American population and we may have that may help us justify keeping that District together.

And increasing our VRA compliance.

Mr. Morgan do you have a question?

>> MR. MORGAN: Yes, I would just point out the population of District 8 right now is almost 11,000 under.

So this may be an opportunity where only adding population may do what you are wanting to do.

And then also this District is in Oakland County and Wayne Counties.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: What is 17 at? I can't see the population for 17 just curious.

>> MR. MORGAN:

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: 812 over.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: VRA.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: 33.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Okay, yeah, I was going to say that lived divot that comes out under 17 from 8 is only 30% African/American and it's 1500 people so that might help too if you want to pull the 16 but I definitely think MC's suggestion probably makes the most sense because of the Asian population.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think what you are suggesting is going in 16; is that correct Commissioner Szetela? I think Commissioner Weiss was looking for some help.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I think 16 going into 16 makes sense.

Yes, those are the neighborhoods.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

That's fine.

We are going to fill that in, in a second.

2057 goes to District 10.

1541 goes to District 10.

And fill that entire in for me please all into District 10.

Scroll down and go south.

>> MR. MORGAN: 1868 want to include that?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Scroll down some and then we are going to fill in the two there of 19 that are on the south that is squared off 1906 and 2501.

And actually we are going to add 2582, 2268 and 2121 as well.

All right, that is all for now we should all be in the green I hope and everything in the highest number should be 41% or around that for Black population and we can also run a partisan fairness but I don't think it's going to mat all that much.

It's not going to change from what we ran.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: What I think you are saying the Black voting age population.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Black voting age population I think we have the districts in question are at 40 or below 40.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Correct so district 9 went from 50 to 40.7 so that is excellent.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: District 6 is 39.86.
13 is 41.77.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: The same as District 8 which is the other one, we wanted to do.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Yep, perfect.

So I think I'm done at this particular point then for rationale for these adjustments this is taking into account the Voting Rights Act and looking at the voting age population and the Black voting age population to make them so that they...so the districts are able to elect candidates of choice and by definition of doing that we are taking into account diverse population of the State of Michigan.

Erasers down.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Witjes Chair Szetela?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Wondering if we can do this a different way without splitting Canton because it has the highly concentrated Asian population trying to preserve its own voting rights concern and community of interest.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Feel free to give it a shot.

I could not do it easily.

I tried to go north adding Farmington Hills in District 9 and then adding Canton back in and it didn't really quite work.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Can we create a clone?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm only saying this because I know when all of this is said and done, they are going to say to me people in Detroit you didn't fight for Detroit so I'm trying to see what is going on so I will have something to say when all this is past. I guess it just appears to me everything stays whole if it's white minority or Bangladesh or non-Hispanic, Blacks everybody stayed together. But looked like Detroit got chopped up and it's a lot of African/Americans there.

So I'm just trying to see where you put everybody.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Right and I think.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: The dots are those the dots.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Those are the dots.

>> MR. MORGAN: I'm going to use a pointer and put a little information on here.

So this precinct here is 35% African/American.

That's what that dot is.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can you tell me What Street John?

>> MR. MORGAN: This is Lafayette right off of 75.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay that is not.

>> MR. MORGAN: This is Lafayette boulevard here and then up north this area here is 87% African/American.

And that's temple, Martin Luther king right up in this area.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: So Lincoln Park, River Rouge.

I don't live in either of the three, but couldn't you kind of spread those dots around to the right? To the south side? More south.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Are you asking we -- what I'm hearing you say.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I don't know I'm just saying I made a statement I wish we could have but no.

I'm just trying to see what the population is and who we are going to be voting with when we get ready to vote.

Because I know that all of the different nationalities have been kept together more or less and look like Detroit got a little bomb and split us every kind of way it was.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes, and what I hear you saying is you also want to understand why we did it this way is that accurate?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I do understand why it was done that way.

It didn't have to be done that way.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: So alternatives.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: But it was done that way.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Want to explore alternatives and we are still at that point Commissioner Curry.

But and I think as we explore and try to get better alternatives, because.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: My thing is I want it in my mind to say that it was drawn fairly.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I know why you kept Canton together.

They are predominately all white.

I know why Birmingham, Bloomfield all those places are predominately white and very wealthy.

I know all of that.

That is what they probably have in contiguous to be together.

But looked like Detroit was along with a few I don't know if they are poor folks or what because.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: If you look at.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Split it all kinds of ways.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: The reason I think we are trying to split it is we are trying to get the numbers that we were given from Dr. Handley at 35% with the Black voting age population that is 35% so we did our best to try to draw that with that kind of understanding that the Black voting age population can elect a candidate of choice. I don't think there are any districts even though they may not look like it. And it looks like it's splintered. But there is no District in here with a Black community cannot elect its candidate of choice.

And sometimes we are.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: What I'm saying is you got some all kind of people, some may vote and some are not caring about voting.

And I'm trying to see where you put all the people who don't really participate in voting, are they in 13 or.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: If you can help us identify where we need to have a higher Black voting age population that would be very helpful is that what you are trying to help us do.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yeah absolutely.

>> MR. MORGAN: Commissioner Curry this is John Morgan and this is the area you were wondering about, there are a lot of these dots up here in the Central part of District 17.

In the southern part there is fewer dots.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay, so you couldn't bring -- John to me it looks like those dots should be more circulated because we are the main Detroit is, it looks like it's where possibly I live and a lot of other people live.

That there is nothing but water and Lafayette big streets and Jefferson which is a Huge Street and not businesses really operating on those streets.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I think it might be useful at this point since we have Mr. Adelson and the districts were based on his consultation and advice into these well it might be useful to have him look at these districts and tell us what his thoughts are with respect to voting rights compliance since he is here and we did redraw these to reduce the percentages.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm fighting too I want it to show a good effort was put in for Detroit because Detroit stays in Detroit most of the time and we look out for people.

People are very contiguous in Detroit and have a lot of things in common.

But the you break them up I might walk across the street and don't know nobody or go down the street and be out of my neighborhood.

And don't know the neighborhood that's there.

That's what I'm saying.

I just want to see the names of what people had.

Because.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Curry.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I don't see anything else that is broke up like that.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: You are helping us get oriented to the area you care about and we are trying to use our time today because we are going to be working until 8:00 p.m. and we have this Senate map and we've done some work today to improve voting rights compliance and we have Mr. Adelson and we also recognize that it's not just voting rights that we want to get to today with this map.

We also want to look at partisan fairness and we want to look at other partisan excuse me other compliance issues so Mr. Adelson do you need an orientation about what we have done today or do you want to sort of dive in how can we assist you assisting us?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Good afternoon and yeah, I think an orientation might be good because just in the time that I've been here there have been a lot of adjustments. But I also have a couple of things to say before we do that.

You know as you know it's very important if not essential that Dr. Handley's analysis be followed for compliance.

And there are different forms of that analysis depending on what County we are looking at whether it's Oakland, Wayne, Genesee, and Saginaw and election results tell the story.

A District can be created with whatever the population is unless the election results prove out that minority voters can elbow select their candidates of choice.

The other consideration fall by the wayside.

As we've discussed the adherence of Dr. Handley's analysis the importance of understanding racial bloc voting and I also just as a coincidence I spent a better part of the weekend discussing racial bloc voting in lots of different configurations.

And it is the Supreme Court has made it very clear that if you pack voters, if voters are put in a District in access of what racial bloc voting analysis shows, that's an issue.

And I know we have talked about that.

And we are going to continue to adhere to it, yes, Commissioner Rothorn.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I want to acknowledge that means anything in Genesee County over 35 to 45% is that true?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: A couple things remember these are estimates. These are based on districts that have never operated in an election. So we are...have election results that in the whole matrix have been dis-aggregated to deal with different geographic areas. So I think as Dr. Handley and I had said previously since they are estimates they are not adhering to an absolute 35%, 45% is not something that in my cautious preference that I necessarily would recommend. Having a range, 35-40%, 40-45%, yeah, I think that's more advisable. And I think two as we talked about last week one of the things that you all with doing or the Commission is doing is that much different than other jurisdictions that I'm familiar with or that I've worked with or dealt with. Remember you are unpacking the districts. You are not concentrating minority voters on the basis of race or color. Beyond the level at which Dr. Handley determined. Which is exactly what the Supreme Court says. So what you are doing is very well it is the effort is compliant but you also have to realize too that typically throughout the United States when noncitizen Redistricting Commissions are drawn, there is a lot of packing. A lot of finagling and I will mention just as an aside. One of the areas I was asked to look at over the weekend involves not Michigan and not a state in this part of the country, where politicians from both major parties basically agreed as if changes as possible and the priority is to keep elected officials in office. So that means packing minority voters at 70, 75, 80 percentage and were ready to go. Needless to say this is drawing a lot of attention but that is completely different from what we are talking about here. And the effort that you are making to deal with the issues that we've discussed. So what I would suggest and request, yes, if I could get some kind of introduction to where things have gone this morning and then also, I suggest that we go down the list of districts, with districts starting potentially in the mid-30s with BVAP and see what the election results tell us. How does that sound? >> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Very possible. Would you like us. >> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can I say something. >> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Curry. >> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, please I think everybody is doing a great job doing these maps and trying to be as fair and honest as we can. I'm just trying to see if Detroit got a fair -- some people that are not going to ever do anything but drink or play outside, they are not going to go and vote nowhere.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

And I was trying to make sure that this area that I know is used to voting don't get split up even though the voting age is the same.

The people don't have a desire to vote you might as well not have the people in the place.

So that is what I'm saying.

That is why I wanted to see.

I know there are people in every nationality that is not going to go around the corner and vote for anybody.

I didn't want to leave Detroit.

I wanted to see where everything is so I know where that area is.

And I don't want to be put in the area where people don't care about voting.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So before we go and look at the election results, I just have something that I'd like to get clarity on.

That might help the rest of the Commissioners too who I believe might be struggling with this.

Mr. Adelson, I appreciate all of the advice that you give us but I got to be honest I'm becoming increasingly uncomfortable with this direction that we're going under.

Because while it is unpacking the districts you know we don't have any District that is close to 90%, 70% or even 60%.

But you know the numbers that we are hitting it just makes me question how is that going to work with actually electing a candidate of choice.

And I think part of the problem I have with this understanding is the analysis did not include primary election results.

So like if we look at District 17 here.

We have it at 35.14% Black voting age population.

If you have a primary election where there is two Black candidates and a white candidate how is it that you know the candidate of choice is actually going to get elected? I understand that in the general election, yes.

All of these districts that we draw are going to be democratic districts.

But that's not where the choice actually happens in these areas.

So I don't know if that helps.

I don't know if I'm being clear on the question I'm asking.

But it's just making me a little uncomfortable having to hit these percentages that are low I would be more comfortable with 45% but 35% thank you Commissioner Curry.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Absolutely I'm in full agreement with you.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I know that is a message relayed to me by other Commissioners as well so I think just some clarity on that would really help me.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioners just as a reminder to not speak over each other.

It makes the interpretation very difficult so please do not speak over each other.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Eid I heard Commissioner Curry did you want to say something more?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I just wanted to say one more thing Anthony touched on what my sentiments were because I know that if the voting population is so low 25, 30, 35 and not even have of those people vote you might as well not have a population hardly at all.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Curry. I know Commissioner Clark but I want Mr. Adelson to respond to what has been asked of him.

Commissioner Clark do you want to go first or should I have Mr. Adelson.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Quick comment. Personally I think we have done a commendable job unpacking Detroit. It's a difficult thing to do. And there is going to be some pros and cons to how we did it. And as would be with anybody. But it's a heck of a lot better than what we had ten years ago. So I think we are headed in the right direction.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Witjes or Mr. Adelson first which one would you prefer.

Go ahead then Mr. Adelson.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Me?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: So I also agree. I think we have a commendable map here as well.

With unpacking Detroit.

But I also agree that that I share Commissioner Eid's concern with almost the exact same question he asked you.

So I really want to hear that.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: And I have to stress and Commissioner Curry were talking about in areas vote or do not vote and we don't have data that I'm aware of or analysis.

I really have to stress this is a data driven legal process.

It's not an anecdotal process it's not a process where we look at something and make conclusive decisions because of that.

The racial bloc voting is dispositive.

The Supreme Court and Federal courts regularly adhere to and expect the parties to comply with.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Racial bloc voting analysis, now, I can't tell just by looking at numbers without looking at election results whether or not these are ability to elect districts.

The point about primary elections Michigan has a very interesting has some interesting processes.

One of them is you select Attorney General candidates in conventions.

You don't hold primary elections for Attorney General.

So that is one primary election that there are no primary elections.

From what I understand from the Secretary of State's office and my own research there are no more contested primary elections statewide in Michigan than what you have.

And you only have there has only been one the 2018 gubernatorial primary which as we have talked about is quite revealing.

And has been quite helpful in crafting some of the districts and making some of the decisions.

So primary elections if you had them statewide primary elections would be helpful.

But we have to work with what we have.

And the election results that I've seen are the one primary election from 2018 statewide.

And the general election.

So I think that it's important to remember that.

That is something that is a little different for me.

I really have not been in a situation where so few contested primary elections are on the table.

At least statewide primary elections.

As far as the numbers we talked about that I've always recommended having a cushion that 35% is an estimate.

Building in a cushion is something that I would recommend since these are estimates but I have to strong there can't be any determinations about Voting Rights Act compliance without looking at election results.

So election results tell all.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Seems like that is where we want to go and I see Commissioner Curry is it important to respond or should we go to election results.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I would like to respond because I will forget my thoughts.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Please go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I don't mean to be the odd ball or the trying to tear down the whole map because I know what we are shooting for and have to do.

But I also know that if you put me in Canton, you put me in Bloomfield Hills Birmingham, Royal Oak and all those places just about 100% of the people that live in those places will vote.

But when you come to Detroit, this I know for a fact, you put some people everybody in Detroit don't vote.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

That is probably why they needed all the help they could get.

Because they don't vote.

Half of Detroit right now do not even know what redistricting is.

And it's not our fall.

I know that.

But some people just don't care.

You got that kind of crowd mixed in with Detroit.

That they don't care what happens.

But when you go to a wealthier place, Southfield, all those places, even Dearborn, whatever people are concerned.

They are concerned.

And when you just put a few people that are concerned that is why I wanted to see where the lines were.

When you see just a few people that a block or two that may vote and you got a whole half of a community that won't even go out their door to vote because they think already they have lost, then you got a problem there.

So I don't think the voting, the voting thing with the nationalities I have a problem with that with Detroit.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Curry I think you are helping us give language to the idea we have not looked at socioeconomics, that we don't we have not addressed that yet and we also haven't looked at that sense of engagement or disenfranchisement is this population disenfranchised and maybe because of socioeconomics and you are helping give language to that so thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You're welcome.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Is it okay if -- what I want to do is pin that.

I want to hold on to that and see if we can get to it after we get to in the election results and trying to understand somehow where we are because I don't unfortunately at this point, we don't have socioeconomics or disenfranchisement as part of the legal criteria that will lead us to better compliance.

Is that accurate Mr. Adelson?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Well, as we know Commissioner Rothorn and we talked about having more data is better than not having enough data.

I'm not aware of any data that addresses that issue.

Dr. Handley didn't include that in her analysis.

So if there are data that speak to that, great.

But I'm not aware of any and we certainly don't have it available from what I understand.

So we do have the election results which although we don't have more statewide primary results, we have what we have.

And that plus Dr. Handley's analysis are both very instructive and essential to compliance.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Mr. Adelson go ahead Commissioner Curry.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm still going to stand on my thesis that Detroit have although they are African mostly black African/Americans you have the voting population that votes I'm going to stick to that.

People do know.

Bruce you should know because I know it and Dr. Allen whatever she knows it.

What I'm trying to say is the whole politician area knows it.

People know it and know the areas where some people about going to vote.

They already know that and do it at every election and don't look for some people to come out.

That is what I'm saying.

We got to keep some of the places where we know people are not going to get up probably even in those rural neighborhoods.

There may be some people that is not even going to go there but it's going to be to their disadvantage.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: So.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY:

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: We are going to build a cushion, Commissioner Curry, because what I hear you saying we need more like 50% more than 35% to justify that.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: It needs to be higher.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: We will try our best. Mr. Adelson will you help us with the election results, please?

I would offer we need 6, 7, 8, 17, 19, 13. And we deliberately tried to unpack 6, 8, 9 and 13 because those are the highest percentages. And we brought them down significantly. And if you would like those numbers, I can give those to you.

>> MR. MORGAN: District 8 not District 17 that Commissioner Curry was talking about.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I want 17 too.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: We talked about a systematic approach to compliance and that is very important for the record and record keeping in general so I would like to start let's start with 6 and work our way down the list.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay here is District 6.

So Zooming in on District 6 it is a portion of Detroit, and then it's Warren then up to Sterling Heights in Oakland County and the current information here is 39.9 non-Hispanic Black and election results is what you want to see.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Please.

>> MR. MORGAN: So District 6 is 65% for Biden, 35 for Trump in 2020. Clinton 66 Trump 34.

In 2012 Obama is 73, Romney is 27.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

In the Senate race Peters is 66 and James is 34.

In 2018 Stabenow 66 James 34.

In 2014 Peters is 74, and land is 26.

And then I've got in 2012 Stabenow is 79 and Hoekstra is 21.

For Governor Whitmer is 67.

And Schuette is 33.

For Governor in 2014 shower is 64.

And Snyder is 36.

For Attorney General Nessel 65.

And Leonard is 35.

For Attorney General in 2014 Totten is 63 and Schuette is 37.

And then for Secretary of State 68 for Benson or 69 and 31 for Lange and Dillard is 62 and Johnson is 38 and then for the Governor's race in the primary El-Sayed is 26.

Thanedar is 26.

And Whitmer is 48.

And again that is District 6 election results.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Okay thank you.

I also want to comment about the primary election results and what the gubernatorial. I spoke to Dr. Handley about the whether there is what the primary results what they reveal of Black voting patterns and included in her analysis they are not statistically reliable for to determine the Black voting patterns because it's somewhat of a lack of cohesiveness.

The cohesiveness is part of the Thornburg versus Gingles requirements. So if there is no cohesiveness among a given minority group, then it's difficult to make valid assumptions and conclusions so we talked about that before and I wanted to add that.

So looking at the results 36 shows I believe across the board that candidates of choice prevail.

The elections are relatively close.

But this is not a District where minority candidates lose.

It's a District where minority candidates of choice win including the bellwether elections that involve minority candidates.

Either at the top of the ticket or as Lieutenant Governor nominee or vice Presidential nominee.

So this District based on the results seems to play out meaning seems to perform in the language of the voting rights act to elect candidates of choice.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: That's good I'm glad it does currently but it would have done the same thing before we lowered the Black voting age population to what we lowered it.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

So I'm trying to figure out what are we comparing this to? Should we compare it to what it was before we made these changes?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Let me speak to something else before I address that I think it's important to remember the U.S. Supreme Court has been absolutely clear that if you put additional minority voters into a District beyond what is needed to elect candidates of choice that's an issue.

So how many there is no bright line figure that over 10%, 20%, 30% but in the Cooper case versus Harris which we have talked about, there was an African/American community that had for 20 years been electing candidates of choice.

They were below 50% voting age.

46%, 47%.

And they had substantial cross over support.

From white voters which Dr. Handley has also concluded exists in parts of Michigan.

Certainly in Wayne County.

So the Court was threw out the districts and threw out the map and said that by including voters minority voters beyond what is necessary that was packing and you have one more voter or 5% voters that is a bright line number.

And in concentrated areas like urban centers you will have an issue that because the population is very concentrated.

It is not always possible to get to mathematical certainty and as I said that I realized that these are estimates so there is no mathematical certainty but what is certain if you pack voters beyond what is needed to elect candidates of choice to give voters an opportunity to elect which is why the voting right requires then you run some -- may have some issues. So I don't know if that completely addresses the point but if as I said before if you want to build in an extra cushion, I think I recommend that.

I think that is important because remember you are not building districts unlike what has happened in the state previously or unlike what has happened in some Court cases of 60, 70, 55, 80% minority population.

You are creating districts where you are diversifying population while retaining, protecting the ability to elect candidates of choice.

So I'm all in favor of and support having a cushion.

I would caution that that's not endless.

A cushion does not mean 60%, 55% certainly in a County like Wayne County where there is cross over support and Dr. Handley's analysis is clear.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioners I'm seeing a couple of Commissioners that need a break.

Commissioner Curry do you want to speak to it now or do you want to try to do it after the break?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I won't be long.
I will be short.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

And if they need to go to the rest room you can excuse them, please.
But I just want to say I'm not even thinking about races when I speak of this.
I'm only speaking from what I know.
I know Canton doesn't have a bunch of slouches in their City.
I know Birmingham, Bloomfield, Rochester Hills, Royal Oak I know those places do not have the burden that Detroit has.
You know, and something and it's not any of our faults.
But what I do know is there is a portion, a large portion and it's probably in other places too.
I'm just not familiar with them.
I'm only speaking and Detroit and not because of one way or the other but I'm just putting my two cents in for the City that I live in.
There is more slouches just about in Detroit it's probably half and half.
So when we do 35 or 40 or 39 or 35 it's really going to be half of that.
Because when I say some people don't participate in anything year in year out day in, day out and it's because of social problems.
And so that's automatically knocking Detroit all the way down when that should not be one of them voting rights for Detroit or any other City that has a poor turn out.
And I do know that the politicians, the people that do the voting they know the cities that have a poor turn out. When you are dealing with a whole 265,000 people and you only get 60 of them voting you know that is a poor turn out and it happens every time the voting area takes place, it always happens like that.
That is why Detroit is so concentrated and so big because we needed the extra bunch to get anything done but to each his own.
I'm just throwing that in there.
It's not only for Detroit.
I will feel that way about Canton or any other place in the state.
When you know that that's happening there should be some kind of something to rectify it.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Curry.

It is 2:25.

Let's take a ten-minute recess.

I'm going to call it 15.

Hearing no objections let's stand in recess for 15 minutes until 2:40, please.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can someone take this black spot off my -- thank you.

[Recess]

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: As Vice Chair of the Commission I'm going to call the recall the meeting back to order Secretary of State would you please call the roll?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Good afternoon, Commissioners and welcome back from your break.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: When I call your name if you are attending remotely, please announce where you are attending remotely from you can use your County City Township or village.

I'll begin the roll call with Doug Clark.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Juanita Curry.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Present; attending remotely from Detroit, Michigan.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Anthony Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Present.

Brittini Kellom?

Rhonda Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Present; attending remotely from Reed City, Michigan.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Steve Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Cynthia Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: MC Rothhorn?

>> VICE COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Rebecca Szetela?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Janice Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Erin Wagner.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Present; attending remotely from Eaton County, Michigan.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Richard Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Dustin Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: 12 Commissioners are present.

And ready to rumble.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Secretary of State staff we are still working with Senate map 165 making adjustments I believe we are going to return to Mr. Adelson and working towards compliance and trying to use some methodology to get through all of the districts that are required today with our Senate map. I believe Mr. Adelson you were just walking us through the election results and did help us understand District 6 as drawn was relatively okay opportunity to elect so we were going to move on.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Yes, please all election results show that it is a performing District.

So my suggestion is as we did on Friday that we go down the list and if it's appropriate for me to do so just mention districts, look at the election results, see what they show and then just keep going.

If there are districts that need attention, we can just make a note of that and come back later.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Mr. Adelson Secretary of State?

>> Can we hold just a second, I think our interpreters froze.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Of course.

Okay Toi are you with us? We are good to go.

Thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: So Mr. Adelson it is appropriate, I think we would that, yeah, I think without objection I'm just going to suggest Mr. Adelson if you help us sort of be methodical and get towards a more compliant Senate map before the next recess that would be we would all be grateful.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Okay then let's do it so let's go next to District 8, please and look at the election results.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay so looking at Senate District 8 which is Hamtramck a portion of Detroit, Warren and Madison Heights, the election results.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: We need a moment while the Secretary of State brings the Zoom meeting back up.

Okay so Mr. Adelson can continue please continue Mr. Adelson.

>> MR. MORGAN: District 8 is Biden is 78, Trump is 22.

For Presidential 16 Clinton is 80, Trump is 20.

For 2012 Obama is 84, and Romney is 16.

For Senate it's 79 for Peters 21 for James.

For U.S. Senate 18 and 78 Stabenow.

And 22 James.

Senate 14 is 85 Peters and 15 land.

For Senate in 2012, 87 Stabenow and 13 Hoekstra.

For Governor it's Whitmer 80.

And Schuette 20.

Then showers 76.

And Snyder is 24.

Then for Secretary of State sorry Attorney General Nessel is 78.

And Leonard is 22.

And 2014Totten is 77 and Schuette is 23.

For Secretary of State Benson is 20 sorry is 80.

Benson is 80.